HUMAN TRAFFICKING AT THE INTERSECT OF HEALTHCARE

Merkeb Yohannes, Senior Program Director
The impact of Intersectionality

- Occupation
- Education
- Race
- Ethnicity
- Religion
- Language
- Heritage/History
- Immigration Status
- Sexuality
- Age
- Ability
- Income
- Gender
- Family Status
- Native American/First Nation
- Geographic Location

Published on Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women (http://criaw-icref.ca)
TRAFFICKING VICTIMS PROTECTION ACT OF 2000 (TVPA 2000)

HUMAN TRAFFICKING IS THE ACT OF INDUCING A PERSON TO PERFORM LABOR OR A COMMERCIAL SEX ACT THROUGH FORCE, FRAUD, OR COERCION.
“Victim of Severe Form of Human Trafficking”

Sex Trafficking

Using force, fraud or coercion to recruit, harbor, transport, obtain, or employ a person for the purpose of commercial sex act, OR a commercial sex act in which a person preforming the act is under age 18.

Labor Trafficking

Using force, fraud or coercion to recruit, harbor, transport, obtain or employ a person for labor or services in involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage or slavery.
THE ELEMENTS OF TRAFFICKING

PROCESS
Recruiting
OR
Harboring
OR
Moving
OR
Obtaining
OR
Employing

a person,

MEANS *
by

Force
OR
Fraud
OR
Coercion

END
For the purposes of
Involuntary Servitude
OR
Debt Bondage
OR
Slavery
OR
Sex Trade
(Commercial Sex Act)

* No force, fraud or coercion required when a child is induced to perform a commercial sex act.
Labor Trafficking
Domestic Service
Sweat Shops/Factories
Panhandling
Agricultural work
Mining
Restaurants
Beauty Industry
Construction sites

Sex Trafficking
Massage Parlors
Brothels (commercial and residential)
Strip Clubs
Escort Services
Porn/Live sex shows

Industries
DISPELLING MYTHS
Testing Our Assumptions

TRUE OR FALSE:

A minor subjected to domestic servitude and sexual assault by the homeowner does not have to show force, fraud or coercion to prove human trafficking.

FALSE

The law does not distinguish between adults and minors for labor trafficking, so all persons must show force, fraud, or coercion. Also, sexual assault is not necessarily a commercial sex act.
Testing Our Assumptions

MULTIPLE CHOICE:

In order for it to be human trafficking:

A) The victim must be moved;
B) The victim must be moved across a state or national border; or
C) No movement is required

Correct Answer: C

Human trafficking occurs regardless of movement or borders.
TRAFFICKING VS SMUGGLING

- Legal, illegal or no border crossing
- Legal or illegal documents
- Coercion and repeated exploitation
- Restricted movement/control
- Commodity: an individual
- Crime against an individual

Profitable business involving human beings

Illegal border crossing
- Illegal (false or stolen) documents
- Voluntary
- Commodity: a service, movement
- Crime against the state

On how to assist and protect victims of human trafficking, Council of the Baltic Sea States, Secretariat, Stockholm 2011
WHAT ABOUT FRAUDULENT MARRIAGES?

• Sometimes human trafficking, but not always
• Foreign nationals are uniquely vulnerable to U.S Citizen spouses because of immigration system
• Initial consent to the marriage does not leave an individual open to exploitation
• Fraud in very common
Testing Our Assumptions

TRUE OR FALSE:

Human trafficking does not require physical harm

TRUE

Force, fraud, or coercion don’t have to be physical. Psychological, financial or legal abuse are considered coercion.
## Risk Factors for Adult Victims

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>History of Trauma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental Health Issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poverty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Runaway/Homeless</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immigration/Language Barrier</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homophobia/Transphobia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Racism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminal History</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Michigan Osteopathic Association - Spring Convention*
THE QUESTIONS WE ASK:

What if the victim isn’t physically hurt?
What if the victim can leave?
What if the victim took the job voluntarily?
What if the victim doesn’t personally feel like a victim at all?

Notice how all of these questions are focused on the wrong person....

The law focuses on the perpetrator's intent. Instead, ask what the perpetrator is trying to do to the victim?
MINDSET OF MANY SURVIVORS

• May not identify their experiences as human trafficking
• May have genuine attachment to trafficking
• Enormous stigma associated with commercial sex and not having immigration status
• Primary concern may be the safety of loved ones
• May have been abused by authoritative figures
• May experience deep shame or self blame
WHAT QUESTIONS CAN YOU ASK?

• Did you feel pressured to do something you didn’t want to do or felt uncomfortable doing?

• Do you feel you were ever deceived or lied to about anything in your relationship?

• How do you support yourself financially?

• Do you decide how to spend your money?

• Tell me about your job; what type of work do you do?

• Can you tell me about your interactions with the criminal justice system?
SCOPE

• WE KNOW VERY LITTLE!
• This is a relatively new issue and we are just starting to identify it.
• Numbers may be skewed because law enforcement and other systems more often identify sex trafficking and not labor trafficking.
WHAT WE DO KNOW

HUMAN TRAFFICKING CASES REPORTED BY STATE

- California (760)
- Texas (455)
- Florida (367)
- Ohio (219)
- New York (206)
- Michigan (176)
- Nevada (169)
- Georgia (157)
- Illinois (135)
- Pennsylvania (127)
- North Carolina (126)
- Washington (99)
- New Jersey (98)
- Virginia (98)
- Arizona (96)
- South Carolina (81)
- Oregon (74)
- Colorado (73)
- Missouri (72)
- Maryland (72)
- Kentucky (71)
- Louisiana (71)
- Tennessee (65)
- Wisconsin (64)
WHAT WE DO KNOW

SINCE 2007

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Calls</th>
<th>Total Victims - Moderate</th>
<th>Total Victims - High</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4,609</td>
<td>1,801</td>
<td>1,359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1,359</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2018 statistics are current as of 6/30/2018.

VICTIMS & SURVIVORS IDENTIFIED

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>High Indicators</th>
<th>Moderate Indicators</th>
<th>Calls From Victims &amp; Survivors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>201</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

442 CALLS THIS YEAR

176 HUMAN TRAFFICKING CASES REPORTED THIS YEAR
WHAT WE DO KNOW

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Trafficking</th>
<th># of Cases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sex Trafficking</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex and Labor</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trafficking Type Not Specified</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor Trafficking</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top Venues/Industries for Labor Trafficking</th>
<th># of Cases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traveling Sales Crews</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail/Other Small Business</td>
<td>&lt; 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hostess/Strip Clubs</td>
<td>&lt; 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recreational Facilities</td>
<td>&lt; 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housekeeping/Cleaning Services</td>
<td>&lt; 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top Venues/Industries for Sex Trafficking</th>
<th># of Cases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hotel/Motel-Based</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residence-Based Commercial Sex</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online Ad, Venue Unknown</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illicit Massage/Spa Business</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pornography</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th># of Cases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender Minorities</td>
<td>&lt; 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th># of Cases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adult</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minor</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citizenship</th>
<th># of Cases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>US Citizen/LPR</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign National</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These statistics are non-cumulative. Cases may involve multiple victims and include males and females, foreign nationals and U.S. citizens, adults and minors. In some cases, callers do not provide demographic information.
## WHAT WE DO KNOW

**BREAKDOWN OF REQUESTS ON HUMAN TRAFFICKING CASES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Request Type</th>
<th># of Cases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Report a Trafficking Tip (140)</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access Service Referrals (23)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Request Crisis Assistance (13)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOP WAYS THE CALLER FOUND THE HOTLINE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th># of Calls</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Referral (49)</td>
<td>442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet (16)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training/Conference (15)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stickers (6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Print Media (5)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOP CALLER TYPES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th># of Calls</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community Member (110)</td>
<td>442</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family of Trafficking Victim (59)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victim of Trafficking (54)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Professional (42)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO Representative (38)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Because it is such an important and prevalent issue, I make it a point to give information to all of my patients about domestic violence, sexual assault and human trafficking at every contact. Even if it is not an issue for you, chances are you know someone who might benefit from you having this information. There is free, confidential help for those who have experienced domestic or sexual violence and human trafficking. In our area, ________ has an excellent program. They offer a crisis line, information, support, individual counseling, support groups and advocacy. They also offer safe shelter for those who want it, however, a person may receive information or support without seeking shelter or deciding to end or leave the relationship.” (Offer written materials, if they are available).
UNIVERSAL EDUCATION RECOMMENDATIONS

“I am also available to talk with you about these issues. However, before I ask any questions or you choose to disclose any information to me, I want to make sure you understand what I am required to keep confidential and what I am required to report by law regarding disclosures of domestic or sexual violence and human trafficking by a patient.”

At this point, inform the patient of the limitations of confidentiality based on obligations to report under...

Medical Mandatory Reporting
Mandatory Child and/or Vulnerable Adult Abuse
Public Health reporting associated to HIV STD testing and partner notification)
RESOURCES

National Human Trafficking Hotline:

CALL: 1.888.3737.888
TEXT: 233733 (BE FREE)

24 hours a day, 365 days a year
Anonymous
Confidential

The hotline will help you determine if a person is a victim and identify local resources to help.

They also have a robust set of outreach and training materials at:
http://www.traffickingresourcecenter.org/
ADDITIONAL RESOURCES

State of Michigan Sexual Assault Hotline  855-VOICES-4

Michigan Migrant Resource Councils: Office of Migrant Affairs/MDHHS 269-615-6308

U of M Human Trafficking Clinic: 734-615-3600 E-mail humantrafficking@umich.edu

Michigan Immigrant Rights Center: 734-239-6863

Database of Human Trafficking Films:  http://humantraffickingsearch.org/film-database/
merkeb.yohannes@mcedsv.org

517-347-7000 ext. 22

MCEDSV.ORG